



REVIEW

Subject: PhD thesis for the award of educational and scientific degree "PhD/Doctor" in: field of higher education 3. Social, Economic and Legal Sciences; Professional Area 3.8 Economics, Scientific Specialty Economics and Management (Agriculture), at the Department of Economics, AU-Plovdiv

PhD candidate: ARDIANA (EMURLAH) BUNIAKU

PhD student in the Department of Economics at the Agricultural University, Plovdiv

PhD topic:

"THE IMPACT OF GOOD GOVERNANCE IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF PROFESSIONAL ACCOUNTANCY ORGANIZATIONS IN THE WESTERN BALKANS"

Reviewer: Prof. Dr DIANA ILIEVA KOPEVA

Department Economics of Natural Resources, Business Faculty, UNWE, field of higher education 3. Social, Economic and Legal sciences; Professional Area 3.8. "Economics", Scientific Specialty "Economics and Management (agriculture)", appointed as a member of the scientific jury with order No. ПД-16-10-90 / 17.10.2019 of the Rector of the AU-Plovdiv

1. Brief introduction of the applicant.

Ardiana Buniaku graduated from the Faculty of Economics at the University of Pristina, Pristina, Kosovo, with a Bachelor's Degree in Public Administration (2006). She received her Master's Degree in Insurance in 2011 from Peter Buddi University, Pristina, Kosovo. Her professional background is in accounting and auditing. Since 2002, she has been part of the Kosovo Certified Accountants and Auditors Organization (SCAAK) team, currently serving there as an Executive Director. She is a member of the International Association of Accountants and the Association of Appraisers in Kosovo, as well as a member of a number of national and international professional organizations. The PhD candidate was enrolled and supervised in a PhD/doctoral program at the Department of Economics, Agricultural University of Plovdiv, in the specialty "Economics and Management (Agriculture)" according to Order of the Rector of AU-Plovdiv № RD 27-13 / 28.05.2018. She

was granted with the right of defense on April 23, 2019 with the Order of the Rector of the Agriculture University, Plovdiv, № RD 27-31 / April 25, 2019.

2. Relevance of the problem.

The topic of the presented PhD thesis is especially relevant and important for agriculture in Kosovo and in other Western Balkan countries. Ministry of Agriculture, Forests and Rural Development ", Pristina, Kosovo, has launched a series of initiatives with representatives of various stakeholders (governments, organizations and institutions, credit institutions, agricultural organizations, producers, universities, professional accounting organizations) to discuss the form and content of the provision of professional accounting services to farmers. The need for professional accounting services is recognized by farmers and they report this in annual Farm structure surveys (more than 70% of Kosovo's farmers state that not using professional accounting services in their activities increases the risk and negatively affects their activities and access to financial resources). This problem also exists in other Western Balkan countries.

The presented PhD thesis examines and analyses the important problems. The conclusions presented in it can find not only theoretical but also practical implementation in solving the problem.

3. Purpose, tasks, hypotheses and methods of research.

The PhD thesis is structured in four chapters with an introduction, a conclusion, an annex containing the questionnaire used in conducted survey, and a bibliography. The total volume of the PhD thesis is 178 pages. The chosen structure, in the presented thesis, is logical and follows the "theory - methodology - analysis" triad that is required in modern research. There is a logical interlink between different parts of the thesis, and drawn conclusions derived directly from the analysis

Among the defined thesis, purpose and objectives of the research, there is the necessary commitment and coherence required in conducting the former. The thesis defended in the PhD thesis is that following good management practices in the management of accounting organizations is a prerequisite for a successful market presence.

In the PhD thesis, the student tested six hypotheses for validity using t-test and correlation analysis, namely:

- RQ1: PAOs in Western Balkans adhere to the principles of good governance effectiveness;
- RQ2: PAOs in Western Balkans adhere to the principles of leadership in governance;
- RQ3: PAOs in Western Balkans adhere to the principle of accountability in governance;
- RQ4: PAOs in Western Balkans adhere to the principles of strategy and control in governance;
- RQ5: PAOs in Western Balkans adhere to the principles of remuneration in governance;
- RQ6: PAOs adhere to all five principles of good governance in Western Balkan countries.

In order to prove or reject the objective thus defined, the PhD student pursues the following goal: to analyze and evaluate the principles of good governance and their impact on the development of professional accounting organizations serving agricultural holdings in Western Balkan countries (Kosovo, Albania, Montenegro, Macedonia , Serbia and Bosnia and Herzegovina).

In order to achieve this goal the following tasks have been done:

1. To clarify the nature of corporate governance and its principles of application in the management of accounting organizations;
2. To develop a methodology for analysis and evaluation of the principles of good governance in the management of accounting organizations;
3. To analyze the regulations governing the activities of accounting organizations;
4. To analyze the elements of good practices that lead to successful market presence of accounting organizations;
5. Define and propose guidelines for improving management practices in the management of accounting organizations

The subject and object of the study are correctly defined. The methods used to prove the conceptual thesis are correctly defined and applied.

4. Visualization and presentation of obtained results.

The results of the analysis and the study presented are appropriately presented in accordance with scientific requirements. The text of the PhD Thesis includes 13 tables and 10 figures. They support the quantitative conclusions made in the text.

5. Discussion of the results and the literature used.

The PhD thesis includes a literature reference containing a list of 114 English sources, of which 10 are electronically accessible sources (e-mail addresses are provided). The other 104 sources are articles, chapters of collective monographs, studies. In the text of the thesis, the sources from the reference are correctly cited in the text.

6. Contributions to the thesis.

I accept the contributions presented by the author as fully proven. Two groups of contributions are outlined in the dissertation: scientific and applied. I would like to emphasize the following contributing points

Scientific contributions

1. The professional accounting services used in practice in six Western Balkan countries have been researched and critically analyzed.
2. The essence of corporate governance as well as the principles and approaches to achieving good management practices have been clarified.
3. A conceptual framework for analyzing and evaluating the principles applied to achieve good management practices in Professional Accounting Organizations (PAOs) has been developed.
4. The principles applied to achieve good governance practices in PAOs in six Western Balkan countries in the field of agriculture are analyzed

Scientific and applied contributions

1. Guidelines for improving management practices in managing accounting organizations are proposed
2. Recommendations for improving corporate governance have been formulated.
3. The survey has been conducted by the PhD candidate
4. The existing regulatory gaps in the application of professional accounting services in agriculture have been identified

7. Critical notes and questions.

My critical remarks are regarding the PhD/doctoral student's publishing activities. The results of the dissertation should be published in scientific journals. My recommendation is in this direction, namely publications on the topic in Bulgarian and international journals, with priority of those with impact factor and indexed in international databases/platforms (SCOPUS, WoS, ERIH, etc.)

I would also recommend in her future work that the PhD/doctoral candidate to continue her efforts to develop models and schemes for providing professional accounting services to farmers that are relevant to Kosovo's agribusiness and implementing them into practice.

8. Published articles and citations.

The results of the PhD thesis are presented in 6 (six) publications. Two of them are conference reports, the rest are published in non-specialized journals. Two of the publications were done prior to enrollment in the PhD. The Journal's websites are not provided.

The presented abstract objectively reflects the structure and content of the PhD thesis.

No list of citations is provided.

CONCLUSION:

On the basis of learned and applied by the PhD student various methods of research, the correctly performed experiments, the summaries and conclusions made, I consider that the presented PhD Thesis meets the requirements of the law and the Internal Rules for its application of the Agrarian University, which gives me reason and argument to vote for it POSITIVELY.

I dare to suggest to the distinguished Scientific Jury also to vote positively and to award Ms. ARDIANA (EMURLAH) BUNIAKU the Doctorate/PhD degree in Economics and Management (Agriculture).

Date: 20/11/2019

Plovdiv

Reviewer:



(Prof. Dr. Diana Kopeva)