



OPINION

on dissertation for obtaining the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in: field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.8. Economics, specialty: Production organization and management (agriculture and sub-sectors).

Author of the dissertation: *ADELINA GAFUR GASHI*, PhD student at the Department of Management and Marketing at the Agricultural University, Plovdiv

Dissertation topic: "THE WORLD BANK INVESTMENT FOR THE AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT IN KOSOVO"

Reviewer: Assoc. prof. VALENTINA LYUBENOVA NIKOLOVA-ALEXIEVA, PhD, University of Food Technology-Plovdiv, Higher Education Area: 3. Social, Business and Legal Sciences, Professional Degree: 3.8 Economics, Specialty: Economics and Management, nominated as a Member of the Scientific jury with order No. RD-16-16/14.01.2020 from the Rector of Agrarian University.

1. The relevance of the problem.

The relevance of the dissertation research could be determined in relation to several major aspects of public, economic and scientific interest.

Firstly, the need to clarify the nature of the World Bank's functioning as an instrument for developing economically backward countries and regions, including Kosovo.

Second is to identify the role of the World Bank in Kosovo's agricultural economic development and its strategic approaches to supporting investment in the agricultural sector.

In the context of preparations for accession to the requirements of the European Union, it is necessary for this industry to build an appropriate infrastructure for the competitive agricultural farms development. Therefore, capital investments in processing facilities, storage facilities for agricultural products and collection points guarantee the sustainable development of primary production and sustainable jobs in the future. To this end, financial support from the World Bank, which in recent years lends credit to the development of this sector, is extremely important.

In this context, I believe that the chosen topic of the dissertation and the results of the *research are relevant for both students and professors, and for business and the public at large.*

2. Purpose, tasks, hypotheses and methods of research.

The relevance and importance of the studied issues are successfully argued in the introduction of the dissertation. The research thesis has been formulated, which is proven in the course of the study by verifying 10 hypotheses explaining the importance of World Bank investment as a major contributor to Kosovo's agricultural development. *The purpose*

and the related work tasks, as well as the subject and object of the research, are correctly defined.

The methodology and research tools chosen are consistent with the complex, multidimensional nature of the study. The main methodological approach in the study is the deductive approach, and the following methods are used to prove the conceptual thesis: linear regression, econometric model - OLS (least squares), analysis of results, interpretation of results, testing of hypotheses.

In her interpretation of the data, the PhD student is based on data from the World Bank, the Kosovo Agency of Statistics (KAS), the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development (MAFRD) research reports, the Central Bank of Kosovo (CBK) reports and bulletins, Green Report (RG), as well as a number of regulations.

The sample was selected using the Taro Ymro formula. A total of 285 respondents were surveyed, of which 235 farms and 50 agro-companies, through questionnaires and in-depth interviews on the research model that was developed. The questionnaire was created through Google forms and emailed to respondents. Data processing is done using SPSS statistical software.

All this leads to the conclusion that Adelina Gashi is well-versed in the current literature on the problem and possesses the necessary theoretical level to study and analyze economic problems, formulate and test hypotheses through empirical evidence and scientific summaries.

3. Visualization and presentation of the results obtained.

The dissertation submitted is in volume of 209 pages. Structurally, it includes an introduction, 4 chapters and a conclusion. The results have been obtained through a modern toolkit and are illustrated with appropriately selected **95 tables** and **29 figures**, which proves the qualities of a doctoral student as a very good researcher.

The structure of the dissertation research is *logically constructed and corresponds to the set goal and tasks*. The work contains specific results and empirical evidence that objectively reflects the real achievements of the research.

4. Discussion of the results and the literature used.

The dissertation analyzes the current scientific achievements in the field of investment and project financing in order to support strategic industries and achieve sustainable development. The bibliographic reference includes a total of **289 sources**, of which **237 are literary**, **22 official reports** and **30 electronic sources**. *The mentioned literature sources are relevant and directly related to the topic of the dissertation.*

The systematizations and summaries made show a thorough and conscientious work with literary sources, skills for applying analytical and deductive techniques for processing a considerable amount of information with various research methodologies.

In the course of the study, a critical review of the theoretical views on the nature of investment theory was made, with references to other theories of governance and development of the economic sectors, regions and countries. A critical analysis of the scientific debate on this subject has been made. Investigation of the relationship between investments and income, investments and productivity in the sector, investments and the way of forming the value chain, investments and market presence of the agricultural sector, investment employment in agriculture.

In order to analyze and evaluate the role of World Bank investments in Kosovo's

agricultural development, 8 critical factors are identified on the basis of a critical analysis. A regression model has been built and adequate recommendations are proposed for balanced territorial development of agriculture and speeding up the process of integration of value chains.

With complete conviction I can confirm that the *doctoral student has a thorough theoretical and methodological background, skills for independent research and the results of the dissertation research prove this my judgment.*

5. Contributions to the thesis.

The contributions can be divided into scientific and applied- scientific ones.

Scientific contributions are related:

- enrichment of knowledge in the field of investment management, in particular project financing and strategic management in agribusiness, based on a critical analysis of theoretical and methodological statements;
- the conceptual framework developed to assess the World Bank's impact on the economic development of agriculture in the Republic of Kosovo.

The applied ones include:

- a model for analyzing and evaluating the World Bank's role in the economic development of agriculture in the Republic of Kosovo is proposed;
- a model of influencing factors has been proposed, with the greatest support from the World Bank for the investment activity of economic agents in agriculture;
- recommendations for formulating effective strategies for improving the economic development of Kosovo's agriculture.

I accept the contributions as real, credible and proven in the course of the dissertation research.

6. Critical notes and questions.

The dissertation presented is a *completed research, with indisputable contributions and qualities*, to which I have no serious critical comments, but I dare to make some recommendations:

- Scientific work could benefit from keeping the balance between the two chapters - Chapter 2 has the smallest volume - 13 pages, and Chapter Four has the largest volume of 74 pages.
- It is recommended that each chapter end with conclusions matching logic thesis.

The recommendations made do not in any way *diminish the value of the achieved results and the doctoral student's work.*

At the same time, I have one question:

Question: The study claims that Kosovo is a poor country, with - the least experience, the lowest unemployment, but it has undergone a rapid transformation and showed rapid growth during the last crisis. What are the factors behind this rapid transformation and growth rate?

7. Published articles and citations.

A total of 6 publications for the 2018-2019 period are presented on dissertation work. Four of them are co-authored and two stand-alone.

The aforementioned publications reflect to a great extent the main achievements of the dissertation.

The information provided in the publications shows that, according to the national minimum requirements for obtaining a doctorate degree, Adelina Gachi has achieved 35 points, which is proof that she has achieved the required number of points on scientometric indicators.

The abstract is presented in the established form and content. It summarizes the main results of the research and gives the necessary idea of the theoretical and applied achievements of the author.

CONCLUSION

Given the merits of the dissertation, the relevance and complexity of the problems studied, the need to find effective solutions for them in practice, the good theoretical level of the studied and analyzed problems, it can be summarized that the submitted dissertation meets the normatively set criteria for awarding the educational and scientific degree "doctor" /according the Law for the Development of the Academic Staff, Article 6, paragraph 2 and paragraph 3 and the Regulations of the Agricultural University for its implementation /.

The aforementioned results of a study on the "***The World bank investment for the agricultural development in Kosovo***" provide sufficient justification for the **HIGHER ASSESSMENT** of the PhD student's scientific potential and research activities.

All this allows me to firmly vote **POSITIVE** for the award of **Adeline Gafur Gashi** to the **Doctorate degree** in professional field 3.8. Economics, specialty: Production organization and management (agriculture and sub-sectors).

DATE: 12.02.2020 r
Plovdiv city

PREPARED
THE OPINION :

(Assoc. prof. \

hD)