



REVIEWS

on the dissertation for obtaining a Doctorate degree in:

Field of higher education: 3. Social, Business and Legal Sciences

Professional Degree: 3.8. Economics

Specialty: Production organization and management

Author of the dissertation: Adelina Gafur Gashi, PhD candidate at the Department of Management and Marketing at Agrarian University - Plovdiv

Dissertation Topic: World Bank Investment Policy for Kosovo Agricultural Sector Development.

Reviewer: Prof. Dimitar Ivanov Kostov from VUSI - Plovdiv, higher education field: 3. Social, business and legal sciences, professional field: 3.8. Economics, Science: Economics and Management.

Appointed a member of the Scientific Jury with Order No. RD-16-16 of 14.01.2020 of the Rector of the AU - Plovdiv.

1. Short presentation of the applicant:

Adelina Gashi graduated from high school in 2007, and in 2012 she received her bachelor's degree from the Faculty of Economics at RIAINVEST College. In 2014, she received her Master's Degree from the Faculty of Economics at the same College.

Since 2017 he is a PhD student in the Department of Management and Marketing at AU - Plovdiv.

She worked at the World Bank for several years. She has participated in many scientific conferences.

2. Relevance of the problem

The dissertation presented deals with a very important issue of the economy of the Republic of Kosovo in the context of its pre-accession period to the European Union.

The topic covers the most important problems of the agrarian sector of the Republic of Kosovo, namely the restructuring of the agrarian sector through the use of funds from the world financial institutions. The relevance and importance of the problem is determined by the fact that for the Republic of Kosovo, the agrarian sector is fundamental both economically and for the nutrition of the population.

Investment policy in the agricultural sector is directly dependent on World Bank assistance. In this regard, the relevance of the topic becomes important not only for the agricultural sector of the country, but also for the state policy. From here, I believe that the importance of the

dissertation is not only important for the agricultural sector, but also of national importance for the economy and politics of the Republic of Kosovo.

3. Purpose, tasks, hypotheses and methods of the study

Purpose:

The purpose of the dissertation is precisely, briefly and clearly stated. It corresponds both to the title of the dissertation and to the rationale presented in the introduction to the relevance and relevance of the topic being researched. From this, it is clear that the problem at hand is relevant and important.

The objective can be formulated with just one sentence - to identify the role and influence of the World Bank for Agriculture in the Republic of Kosovo. I believe that this is more precise, clearer and less definable. So did the author of her dissertation.

In order to support the rationale for the goal, the author has identified several questions to determine, and what exactly will be sought to achieve the goal.

Tasks: Tasks are in optimal numbers and well formulated. They are sufficient to achieve the intended purpose. It is good to note that their arrangement and resolution is very well done so that the problem developed is also covered in a certain sequence by continuity.

It is quite logical to begin by clarifying theoretical questions of a methodological and methodological nature. I believe that the definition is that investment plays an important role and is a factor determining the competitiveness of the agricultural sector. And that's why the doctoral student put that task first.

The second and third tasks complement each other. This is good because it can more fully determine the impact of the World Bank for Agriculture in Kosovo.

Very correctly, after solving these tasks and identifying approaches and strategies, it is the last task to formulate recommendations for improving the investment environment. It is good to note that it is very logical to say that improving the investment environment in general, and not only specifically for World Bank investments, is independent of the fact that the topic is specific for World Bank investment. For me, this defines the broad view of the doctoral student on the problem of dissertation work.

Subject of study:

Here, I will draw attention to the sub-goals that shape the research thesis on the issues of measuring the World Bank's investment policy, its role, its instruments for achieving good results, and the benefits of this policy for farmers and agribusiness in Kosovo in general.

The subject of the research is clearly stated in the title of the dissertation.

Author's research thesis:

The topic of the dissertation is very specific and this defines the thesis of the doctoral student to be formulated in one sentence - the World Bank's Kosovo Agriculture Support Investment Policy in Kosovo is a key factor in its development.

Research Approaches and Methods:

The deductive approach was adopted in the analysis as a basic one, supported by the traditional methods used mainly. For this purpose, a specialized software product SPSS and a statistical package of MS Excel were used.

4. Overview and presentation of the results obtained:

The dissertation is very well illustrated, both in appearance and content. It is made according to the requirements and presented in a readable form.

Large-scale empirical information was used to conduct the study and to produce a good result. Empirical research information is provided by many sources. 126 scientific publications and works of authors have been used. This information is supported by newsletters from the World Bank and other international financial institutions, so that the list of references is more than 200.

The structure of the dissertation is in a classic presentation. Development of a total volume of 209 pages and applications. The material is illustrated with 29 figures and 95 tables.

The individual parts of the dissertation work are in optimal proportion. The material is presented in an accessible way and allows it to be easily and visually perceived easily and well. The applications are also well illustrated.

5. Discussion of results and literature used:

I will discuss in more detail the structure of the dissertation. It shows that the methodical part is a separate chapter of development - the second chapter. This shows that the author has a good theoretical background and is well versed in the subject matter in which he is developing his thesis.

The introduction thoroughly studies, identifies and analyzes information related to the role and importance of the World Bank for Agriculture in the Republic of Kosovo. This has been done with very good skill in linking agricultural output with other sectors of the country's economy. The PhD student expresses her own opinion about the role of the international financial institution in investing in the country. The author of the dissertation argues very well her choice regarding the topic of the research.

In the introduction, the author presents extensive information about the World Bank and its role in assisting agriculture in the Republic of Kosovo. This more extensive introduction to this dissertation is necessitated by the fact that the subject of the study is outside Bulgaria and for us acquainted with the research more information is needed for the research subject. I consider this a big plus of my dissertation work. The introduction also outlines the World Bank's commitments to the development of the agricultural sector in the Republic of Kosovo. I think that this way, in the introduction, those familiar with the research materials gain an idea of the large volume of work done in relation to the problem and the great importance of the dissertation.

The theoretical part of the 26-page dissertation demonstrates the critical review made by the doctoral student with respect to many of the authors who have published the material related

to the investment process. This is done by skillfully linking the investment process to the management process. The author has his own view of the issues of theories and critical analyzes on this problem.

Quite rightly, the doctoral student links investing issues to income and productivity issues. It skillfully traces the formation of the value chain and the market share of the agricultural sector in the country's economy.

In the first place, the doctoral student dwells in detail on investment theory and skillfully relates the investment process to the size of the farm, the income from agricultural activity and jobs.

In this part of Chapter One, she discusses the publications of a number of authors relevant to macroeconomic theory. The author discusses and discusses their discussions.

It places considerable emphasis on the various theories of capital and investment. These theories provide useful information and insight into investing. Against them, however, the author expresses her own critical opinion, which shows her keen awareness of the theoretical issues of the dissertation. The PhD student analyzes a group of authors with publications on investment uncertainty.

Secondly, the theoretical part of the dissertation deals with the role of investment support of the World Bank for Agriculture in the Republic of Kosovo.

This part of Chapter One provides an extensive analysis of the activities of these institutions globally, and in particular in the Republic of Kosovo.

Other financial institutions, such as the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development, the International Development Association, the Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency and others, make similar analyzes. An analysis of the work of these international financial institutions shows that the doctoral student is well aware of the opportunities the Republic of Kosovo has for financing outside the country's agricultural sector.

As I stated above, the doctoral student has developed very well the methodology and methodology of the research, which made it possible to separate the methodical part into a separate chapter of the dissertation.

Based on an in-depth analysis of the World Bank's activities and its role in financing the agricultural sector of the Republic of Kosovo, the author identifies several critical factors that underpin the methodology. Basically she perceives that these are the factors: contribution to income generation in agriculture, job creation, improvement of labor productivity, formation of value chains, efficiency of agricultural holdings, financing in the sector, size of grants and the general climate of investment.

These factors have been identified using a deductive approach. Based on this analysis, the doctoral student determines the relationship between private investment in the agricultural sector and its determinants. In this regard, it divides the study into two parts: the first part is an overview of existing investment theories to identify the most important components influencing the development of the agricultural sector and the second part is related to empirical analysis, including methods and methodology for analysis of data through a survey.

The subject of the empirical analysis was made on 400 farms. The author's personal contribution is both the collection and processing of the information and the procedure for

selecting the respondents. The large number of respondents and the large volume of information processed proves both the reliability of the results and the good preparation of the doctoral student.

The large number of questions included in the survey also indicates that the results are credible and can serve to produce a high-level dissertation.

The contribution of the dissertation is also the hypotheses used to process the information.

The third chapter of the dissertation includes the project part. This part is very clearly defined as a topic as it identifies the investment parameters of the model. I am fully convinced that a scientifically sound investment model has been obtained in the agricultural sector of the Republic of Kosovo and that this is a doctoral student's personal contribution.

The proposed model very skillfully analyzes the various hypotheses and finds one that proves the research thesis.

On the basis of a good, accurate and proven analysis, the most correct conclusions are made. Very good recommendations are made based on these conclusions. The recommendations made, which are nine in number and very well justified, are an excellent conclusion to the dissertation.

The conclusion is very clear and precise.

6. Contributions to the thesis

I accept the references for my dissertation contributions and present them in the following form:

I. Scientific contributions:

1. The nature of investment and its contribution to the agricultural sector has been clarified.
2. A conceptual framework has been developed to assess the impact of the World Bank on the development of the agricultural sector in the Republic of Kosovo.
3. A procedure has been developed for interviewing agricultural producers to collect information on investment processes in the sector.

II. Scientific and applied contributions

1. The nature of the World Bank's functioning in investing in the Agrarian Sector of the Republic of Kosovo has been clarified.
2. Recommendations for improving the agricultural sector in the Republic of Kosovo have been formulated.
3. A model with investment parameters has been developed for financing the agricultural sector in the Republic of Kosovo by the World Bank.

7. Critical notes and questions

I. Questions:

1. What is the World Bank's funding rate for the agricultural sector in the Republic of Kosovo from the total percentage of foreign investment in the sector.

II. Critical notes:

1. There is no table for abbreviations.

2. There is no Declaration on the originality and authenticity of the information used (according to Art.

8. Published articles and citations

More than necessary publications have been made in the dissertation. They have been published in renowned academic editions.

The abstract presented objectively reflects the content of the dissertation.

The dissertation submitted for defense is a fully completed scientific study with considerable value for science and practice.

The author of the thesis is a distinguished specialist in the field of economics. He speaks several languages, has several specializations, which proves that he can be both a good specialist and a good scientist.

Conclusion:

On the basis of the various research methods applied and applied by the doctoral student, the correctly performed experiments, the summaries made and the conclusions drawn, I consider that the presented dissertation work fully meets the requirements of the ZRASRB and the Regulations of the Agricultural University for its application, which gives me reason to rate it POSITIVE.

I allow myself to offer the Honorable Scientific Jury also to vote in the affirmative and to JUDGE Adelina Gafur Gashi Educational and Scientific Degree (ONS) Doctor of Science in Organization and Management (Production).

Reviewer:

/ Prof. D. Kostov /