



OPINION

on a dissertation for obtaining the educational and scientific degree "**Doctor**" in field of higher education **3. Social, economic and legal sciences**, professional field **3.8. Economics, scientific specialty Organization and management (agriculture and sub-sectors)**

Author of the dissertation: DZEVDET FEHMI BUSHI, PhD student in part-time form at the Department of Management and marketing at the Agricultural University, Plovdiv

Topic of the dissertation: "DEVELOPMENT OF ECONOMIC SUSTAINABILITY OF VINEYARD HOLDINGS IN KOSOVO"

Reviewer: Assoc. Prof. VALENTINA LYUBENOVA NIKOLOVA-ALEXIEVA, PhD from the University of Food Technologies-Plovdiv, field of higher education: **3. Social, economic and legal sciences**, professional field: **3.8 Economics**, scientific specialty *Economics and management*, appointed as a member of the scientific jury with order № RD-16-1076/25.11.2020 by the Rector of Agricultural University.

1. Relevance of the problem.

Investing funds in the wine sector in Kosovo has characteristics that distinguish it from other sectors of agriculture, due to the specifics of the sector, the nature of plantations, the concentration of significant costs per unit area, the long payback period, the intertwining of biological with economic processes, the specifics of technological solutions, as well as the unique properties and qualities of the manufactured product and the added value in the process of reaching the end user. The expansion of the vine culture in Kosovo, the adaptation of its varietal composition in order to produce high quality grapes necessitate a study of the economic sustainability of vineyards, as it will depend on the future development of the country's wine sector. In an economy based on competition and demand, the problem of economic sustainability of vineyards is becoming vital.

In the context of Kosovo's economic interests and prospects, the undisputed topic of the dissertation and the results obtained *determine its relevance and significance*. Insufficient research in the field of economic sustainability of farms with different specialization and intensification raises the need for scientific work with a similar focus.

In this regard, it can be concluded that the topic of the dissertation was successfully chosen. It is extremely up-to-date, dissertable and has great practical significance.

2. Purpose, tasks, hypotheses and research methods.

In the introduction of the dissertation the main goal and six logically connected tasks for its achievement are formulated. The **object** and the **subject** of the research are correctly defined, as well as the main **thesis** of the author, according to which the level of economic sustainability of the vineyard under equal other conditions is influenced by the type of organizational form and the applied production technology. The tasks were completed in the course of the research, and the formulated research thesis was proved.

In the dissertation, the vineyard is perceived as a production and economic system, which is why a systematic approach is applied in its research and analysis.

To determine the degree of use of production resources in vineyards and their economic sustainability, both the neoclassical theory of farm activity under market conditions and the theory of transaction costs are used.

The following methodological tools are used to prove the conceptual thesis of the dissertation: systematic analysis; index method; statistical methods - descriptive statistics, t-test, one-way analysis of variance, chi-square analysis and the method of multiple comparisons.

The specialized software product SPSS and statistical package of MS Excel were used in the processing of the empirical information.

The methodological tools are appropriately selected, in accordance with the set goals and objectives.

In interpreting the data, the doctoral student is based on data from scientific publications and works of Kosovo and foreign authors; newsletters of international organizations; reports and bulletins of the Kosovo Ministry of Agriculture, as well as a number of regulations. Empirical information about the survey is also provided by surveys, the sample includes 240 vineyards, with a total area of 16,445 decares, which is 90.5% of the registered vineyards in Kosovo.

3. Visualization and presentation of the obtained results.

The presented dissertation is **122 pages** long. Structurally, it includes an **introduction, 3 chapters, a conclusion and appendices**. The results were obtained using modern tools and are illustrated with appropriately selected **14 figures** and **16 tables**. After the main text and the conclusion 3 appendices are added:

Appendix 1. Survey: Study of the state of viticulture in Kosovo.

Appendix 2. Results of testing a statistical hypothesis in an intergroup comparison of the average values of the indicators in groups of wine companies – family companies and sole traders.

Appendix 3. Results of testing a statistical hypothesis using ANOVA.

The structure of the dissertation research is *logically constructed and corresponds to the set goal and tasks*. The paper contains concrete results and empirical evidence that objectively reflect the real achievements of the research.

4. Discussion of the results and used literature.

The dissertation analyzes the current scientific achievements in the field of management of vineyards to achieve high quality and sustainable development. The bibliographic reference includes a total of **107 sources** in English.

These literature sources are directly related to the topic of the dissertation.

The systematizations and summaries made show in-depth and conscientious work with the literature, skills for application of analytical and deductive techniques for information processing with different research methods.

The presented dissertation is a **completed study on a topical and significant socio-economic problem**. In the course of the study, the most significant theoretical and practical issues related to increasing the efficiency and building competitive advantages of the wine sector in Kosovo were raised and discussed.

Dzevdet Bushi has in-depth theoretical and methodological training, skills for

independent research and the results of the dissertation research prove this assessment of mine.

I appreciate the concrete results obtained, on the basis of which scientifically sound conclusions and recommendations have been made regarding the increase of the economic sustainability of the vineyards in Kosovo, through the consolidation of the cultivated areas of vineyards and integration with the processing industry.

Stakeholders in the study can be educational and training organizations for the purposes of vocational training, business organizations with different industrial profiles, organizations from the non-governmental sector, state and regional authorities.

5. Contributions to the dissertation.

Contributions can be divided into scientific and scientific-applied.

Scientific contributions include the enrichment of knowledge in the field of management and sustainable development, through the proposed conceptual framework for assessing the economic sustainability of the vineyard.

The scientific-applied ones include:

- recommendations for improving the sustainable development of vineyards in Kosovo, based on the analysis and assessment of the level of their economic sustainability, as well as the factors that determine it.
- the proposed models for increasing the sectoral sustainability and cooperation for better economic sustainability of the vineyards.

I accept the contributions as real, reliable and proven in the course of the dissertation research.

6. Critical remarks and questions.

The presented dissertation is a completed study, with indisputable contributions and qualities, to which I have no serious critical remarks, but I allow myself to give some recommendations:

- The bibliographic reference (107 sources) shows a good literary awareness of the doctoral student, although the topic suggests the use of a richer set and more modern literary sources.
- It is recommended that each chapter ends with conclusions that clearly show the implementation of the goal and related tasks.
- It is necessary to emphasize more clearly and categorically one's own opinion on the considered theoretical problems.
- Scientific work could benefit from the balance between the individual chapters - the presented structure focuses on the second chapter, which is significantly larger than the first and third chapters (which reveals the possibility for better balancing of the text).

The recommendations made in no way diminish the value of the results achieved and the situation of the doctoral student's work.

At the same time I have a question for the doctoral student:

Question 1: How does the development of genetics, artificial intelligence, robotics, 3D printing, nanotechnology, biotechnology affect the management and sustainable development of the wine sector in Kosovo?

7. Published articles and citations.

A total of 5 publications for the period 2014-2020 are presented, dedicated to the dissertation, of which 1 co-authored and four independent. One of them was published in a scientific journal with an impact factor.

These publications largely reflect the main achievements of the dissertation. In terms of volume and quality, they meet the requirements for obtaining an Educational and scientific degree "Doctor".

The abstract is presented in the established form and content. It reflects in a generalized form the main results of the research and gives the necessary idea of the theoretical and applied achievements of the author.

CONCLUSION

Given the merits of the dissertation, the relevance and complexity of the researched problems, the need to find effective solutions for them in practice, the good theoretical level of the researched and analyzed problems, it can be summarized that the presented dissertation meets the criteria for awarding the scientific and educational degree "Doctor" /ZRASRB and the Regulations of the Agrarian University for its application /.

These results of the study, dedicated to "DEVELOPMENT OF ECONOMIC SUSTAINABILITY OF VINEYARDS IN KOSOVO" provide sufficient grounds for a **HIGH EVALUATION** of the scientific potential and research activities of the doctoral student.

All this allows me to confidently vote **POSITIVE** for the award of **Dzevdet Fehmi Bushi** the scientific and educational degree "Doctor" in professional field 3.8. Economics, scientific specialty Organization and management (agriculture and sub-sectors).

Date: 11.01.2021 r
Plovdiv

PRODUCED BY:

.....
(Assoc. Prof. Valentina Nikolova-Alexieva, PhD)