

## REVIEW



on a dissertation for obtaining the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in: field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.8 Economics, scientific specialty Organization and management (agriculture and industries)

**Author of the dissertation:** KUSHTRIM EMRUCH QAMILI

PhD student part-time preparation at the Department of Management and Marketing at the Agricultural University, Plovdiv

**Topic of the dissertation:** INCREASING THE EFFICIENCY OF SALES OF AGRICULTURAL ENTERPRISES IN ALBANIA

**Reviewer:** Prof. Dr. Stela Todorova - AU, field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences; professional fields: Economics, Administration and Management; scientific specialties: Economics and Management (Agriculture), National Economy.

appointed a member of the scientific jury by order № RD-16-985/ 7.10.2022 by the Rector of AU.

### 1. Relevance of the problem

The radical change in the economic conditions in Albania during the transition to a European market economy has led to the fact that enterprises in the country are faced with the need to independently ensure not only the production, but also the sale of their products. In the conditions of reduced solvent demand and emerging competition with imported goods, the problem of sales becomes of primary importance. Enterprises face the previously absent problem of bad debts arising, delays in receiving payments from product buyers as well, resulting in financial losses for the enterprise and reducing the enterprise's profit. In view of the above, I believe that the topic chosen by the doctoral student is extremely relevant.

### 2. Purpose, tasks, hypotheses and research methods

The purpose of the work is to theoretically substantiate and develop an approach to planning the conditions for the sale of agricultural products to achieve maximum efficiency of the enterprise in the conditions of a transitional economy.

Achieving the goal is related to solving a number of research tasks:

- to examine the changes in economic conditions that occurred in the Albanian economy during the years of reforms and to identify their impact on the marketing activities of agricultural enterprises;

- to study the scale of the use of trade credit in the local industry in general and in the agricultural industry in particular;
- to summarize domestic and foreign experience in managing the payment process with product buyers using mathematical modeling methods;
- to study the process of developing a credit policy for an industrial agrarian enterprise;
- to propose a methodology for managing cash and barter flows in an agricultural enterprise in the conditions of the modern Albanian economy;
- to develop mathematical models that enable the process of planning the terms of sale of products, choosing the optimal plan for the delivery of products to consumers and forecasting cash flows and barter supplies for shipped products.

The object of the study are large and medium-sized enterprises from the agricultural sector in Albania. The subject of research is the process of planning the conditions for the sale of products in the enterprise of the agricultural sector. The analyzes and conclusions drawn in the work are based on the theoretical study of local and foreign economic literature, thematic materials from periodicals, as well as materials obtained in the process of the author's practical work in agricultural enterprises in Albania. In the course of the research, data from the financial reports of agricultural enterprises (OJSC Likinskaya Manufaktura, CJSC Tirotext, CJSC Tirana Weaving and Finish Plant, OJSC Agricultural Firm) were used. Other methods that the doctoral student uses are economic-mathematical methods (linear programming, simulation). The optimization and simulation calculations, as well as the processing of the results, were carried out using specially developed programs in the algorithmic programming language Visual Basic for Applications (VBA) in the environment of the Microsoft Excel software package.

### **3. Transparency and presentation of the obtained results**

The dissertation submitted for my opinion is 126 pages in length and includes an introduction, three main chapters, conclusions, a conclusion, a bibliography with 114 titles. The study is very well illustrated with tables, diagrams, figures and relevant appendices.

### **4. Discussion of the results and the literature used**

The first chapter "New phenomena in the commercial activity of agricultural enterprises in Albania during the transition to a market economy" is devoted to the analysis of the changes that occurred in the sales activity of agricultural enterprises in Albania during the transition to a market economy. An analysis of scientific publications has been made and the conclusion is made that currently local agrarian enterprises are forced to pay much more attention to sales activities, as the wholesale system is not sufficiently developed. Different forms of non-cash payments are examined and classified. The extent of their influence on the Albanian economy and on the agricultural industry in particular is assessed. The features of the manifestation of the crisis of non-payments in the agricultural sector have been analyzed. The question of the influence of the methods of supplying the enterprise with resources on the specifics of its marketing activity and the process of payment with the buyers of products is considered.



In the second chapter "Management of the planning process of the sale of products in the agrarian enterprise" the process of payment with the buyers of products, its place in the commercial policy of the enterprise and its relationship with other elements of sales are considered. The scale of the use of commercial credit in the sale of agricultural products was analyzed, emphasizing the need to significantly increase its share during the transition from a planned economy to a market economy. The work of local and foreign scientists on this problem was analyzed, drawing a conclusion about the insufficient development in this direction, as well as the lack of appropriate methods and mathematical models that allow enterprises to plan the process of receiving payments from buyers under Albanian conditions. A methodology is proposed that allows to effectively manage the cash and barter flows for the sale of products in the context of the spread of barter in settlements.

In the third chapter, "Using mathematical models for planning the terms of sale of agricultural products", mathematical models are proposed that allow optimization of the decision-making process regarding credit and discount policy. The proposed mathematical model for choosing the optimal option for the delivery of products to different consumers allows to maximize the cash and barter flows for the sale of products. In order to ensure the comparability of cash and barter income, a methodological approach is proposed, with the help of which barter transactions are reduced to cash, which allows taking into account the additional costs arising from the use of barter transactions.

The simulation model of cash and barter flows for product sales allows estimation of the most likely volume of incoming cash and other resources for products shipped to customers. The conclusion of the dissertation summarizes the main conclusions of the results obtained during the research and analysis of the problem and makes valuable recommendations for solving a large part of the emerging problems. The general assessment that I make of the dissertation work is as follows: the literature used by the doctoral student corresponds to the research, the authors are cited accurately and correctly, the goals and tasks set in the dissertation work are completely solved. The style is scholarly and understandable.

## **5. Contributions of the dissertation work**

The dissertation has evidence of scientific and scientific-applied contributions, presented as views and solutions on the problem to which the dissertation is dedicated. The scientific and scientific-applied contributions indicated in the abstract correspond to the actual contribution moments in the dissertation. A methodology has been developed for the management of cash and barter flows for the sale of the production of an agricultural enterprise in an economy in transition;

1. A mathematical model is proposed that uses the method of linear programming and allows obtaining an optimal plan for the supply of agricultural products based on the analysis of the conditions of applications from potential users;

2. A simulation mathematical model is proposed that allows predicting the receipt of funds from users for shipped products.

3. Information and software support for the proposed mathematical models has been developed;

4. Recommendations are formulated for the different possibilities of using the developed mathematical models in planning the process of mutual payments with the consumers of agricultural products.

#### **6. Critical notes and questions**

The work of doctoral student Kushtrim Emrush Qamili represents a complete scientific and applied research, therefore I have no critical remarks. I have a recommendation that the doctoral student, after the defense of the dissertation, should continue and expand his work aimed at researching current problems for the country.

#### **7. Published articles and citations**

The doctoral student has submitted a list of 5 publications that are related to the topic of the dissertation. They are proof that some of the problems investigated in the dissertation have received scientific recognition. The presented abstract reflects objectively the structure and content of the dissertation work.

#### **CONCLUSION:**

Based on the various research methods learned and applied by the doctoral student, the correctly conducted experiments and developed models, the generalizations and conclusions made, I consider that the presented dissertation meets the requirements of the ŽRASRB and the Regulations of the Agrarian University for its application, which gives me a reason to rate it POSITIVELY. I take the liberty of proposing to the honorable Scientific Jury to also vote positively and award Kushtrim Emrush Kamili the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the scientific specialty Production Organization and Management.



(Prof. Dr. S. Todorova)

Data: 28.10.2022, Plovdiv